REAL CHALLENGES
INFORMING HISTORIC DISTRICT GUIDELINES
PRESERVING HISTORIC TEXAS
2020 CONFERENCE
JANUARY 30, 2020 9:30 am

Murray G. Miller, Historic Preservation Officer, City of Fort Worth
Assistant Professor of Historic Preservation, UTA at Arlington
“If it be asked us to specify what kind of amount of art, style, or other interest in a building makes it worth protecting, we answer, anything which can be looked on as artistic, picturesque, historical, antique, or substantial: any work, in short, over which educated, artistic people would think it worth while to argue at all.”

William Morris, the SPAB Manifesto (1877)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Design Guidelines</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Predominant Character</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Form &amp; Character</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Existing Conditions</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Designing in Context</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contextual Site Plans</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corresponding Streetscape Elevations</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plans &amp; Elevations</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annotated Elevations</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accurate Drawings</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Work in Context</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Depicting Site Context</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inform by Character</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship of Garages to Primary Dwelling</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Character of Driveways</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accessory Structures Shown in Context</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Front Yard Parking</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fences &amp; Parking</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CONTENTS

35 Streetscape Character
36 Visual Effects of Front Yard Parking
37 Effects on Streetscape Character
38 Entrances & Porches
39 Expressing Traditional Form & Features
41 Setback & Massing
42 Setbacks
43 Roof Form
44 At-Grade Porches
45 Orientation
46 Driveway Width
47 Parking
48 Approved Plans
49 Subsequent Applications
50 Mirror Images
51 Repetitiveness
52 Exploration through Design
54 Alternatives to Repetitiveness
56 Sameness
57 Out of Context
58 Inform by Character
59 Character Infill
60 Reflecting Traditional Elements
63 Out of Context
66 Accessory Structures NOT Shown in Context
CONTENTS

67 Additions & Alterations Shown in Context
68 Massing & Design for Accessory Structures
69 Site Positioning of Accessory Structures
70 Relationship of Additions
89 Roof-top Additions
90 Second Story Additions
99 Garage Alterations
103 Alterations to Exterior Materials
106 Alterations to Character-Defining Features
107 Accessibility Solutions
108 Windows
111 Substitute Materials
Historic District A

The primary concern of the historic district is to preserve the overall character, identity and presence of the neighborhood.
Historic District B

The standards and guidelines shall establish the acceptable physical characteristics of each building or structure and site, and any modifications thereto, including layout and location of site, size, shape, materials, and fenestration.

The Standards and Guidelines shall preserve and protect places of historic and cultural importance as well as the overall visual characteristics of the District.
**DESIGN GUIDELINES**

**RECOMMENDED**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recommendation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Using the same forms, materials, and color range of the historic building in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a manner that does not duplicate it, but distinguishes the addition from</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the original building.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basing the alignment, rhythm, and size of the window and door openings of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the new addition on those of the historic building.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incorporating a simple, recessed, small-scale hyphen, or connection, to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>physically and visually separate the addition from the historic building.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distinguishing the addition from the original building by setting it back</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>from the wall plane of the historic building.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Historic District B**

Additions shall be differentiated and compatible, so that the new work does not appear to be part of the historic building; the character of the historic resource should be identifiable after the new addition is constructed.

Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties
What is the primary reason for the Historic and Cultural Landmark District? The district overlay zoning is a tool which can be used to promote appropriate restoration by encouraging compatibility of new construction, and appropriate restoration of existing structures and other actions which would result in preservation of the distinctive visual character of the neighborhood.
Historic District A

Replace windows only when they cannot be reasonably refurbished.
**Design Guidelines**

**Historic District A**

When replacing windows, match the dimension and profile in order to avoid a change to the size of the original opening.

Replacement windows should be of a similar style, profile and dimension as the existing.

**Historic District B**

Aluminum doors and windows are prohibited.
NEW main structures shall be two story (excluding basement and attic) comparable to and compatible with existing buildings on the block and in the District.

Second stories shall not be added to single story houses.
**PREDOMINANT STYLES**

**Bungalow/Craftsman (43%)**

Bungalow/Craftsman

Primary front gable with lower projecting front gable porch; tapered wood columns on brick piers with balustrade; exposed rafter tails; mostly single story

**National Folk (19%)**

National Folk

Little ornamentation; common folk style; one story L-plan; front gable bay with side gable wing with shed or hipped roof porch between bay and wing

**Folk Victorian (11%)**

Folk Victorian

Simple folk forms with patterned shingles on gable; spindled porch columns; bracketed window hoods; friezes
Historic District A

The primary concern of the historic district is to preserve the overall character, identity and presence of the neighborhood.
FORM & CHARACTER

Masonry as primary exterior wall material
Attached garage
Character of Entrance
Roof Form
“I’m aiming for ‘aggressively non-contextual.’”
FORM & CHARACTER

Character of Entrance

Attached garage

Masonry as primary exterior wall material

1 North - Front
1/8" = 1'-0"

Roof 17' - 0"
Plate line 9' - 0"
Floor Plan 0' - 0"
Grade -0' - 6"
FORM & CHARACTER

Strong Masonry Detail

Window Proportions

Roof Forms, Pitches and Relationships

- Roof
  - 17' - 0"

- Plate line
  - 9' - 0"

- Floor Plan
  - 0' - 0"

- Grade
  - 0' - 6"

1 West
1/8" = 1'-0"

Hardie Fascia & Soffits - Typical

Single Ply Roofing

Compo-Shingle Roof

Brick Veneer

Steel Post
EXISTING CONDITIONS

Contributing properties
DESIGNING IN CONTEXT

- Proposed design
- Vacant lot
- Contributing properties
- Proposed design
- Uncharacteristic of the District
Site plans must show all existing structures, curb-cuts, street names, etc.

The site plan must show the proposed work as dimensioned to the property boundary, be drawn accurately and to scale.

Site plans must show required setbacks and include the footprints of a sufficient number of flanking properties to inform the average setback along the block.
CORRESPONDING STREETSCAPE ELEVATIONS

CHARACTER ELEVATION

SCALE: 3/16" = 1'

RECOMMENDED
The two-dimensional aspects of buildings are described as elevations.

Each elevation where a change is proposed must be drawn accurately, to scale.

In this example, the roof ridge is the same height on all elevations and the front-sloping roof plane is the same pitch as the rear-sloping roof plane.

Dormers on the south roof slope will also be drawn on the east and west elevations.

All elevations must show existing and proposed changes and all exterior materials (including doors and windows) must be shown on the drawings.
ANNOTATED ELEVATIONS

RECOMMENDED

NOT RECOMMENDED
ACCURATE DRAWINGS

All elevations must show the proposed work and be drawn accurately and to scale.
ACCURATE DRAWINGS

All elevations must show the proposed work and be drawn accurately and to scale.

Elevations must be depicted in relation to their context. For new primary structures, elevations that face a street must also show the flanking properties depicted in the Site Plan.
All elevations must show the proposed work and be drawn accurately and to scale.

Elevations must be depicted in relation to their context. For new primary structures, elevations that face a street must also show the flanking properties depicted in the Site Plan.

Elevations must show all exterior materials including doors and windows.
Additions and new structures must be shown in relation to nearby structures.

Streetscapes, which show the outlines of flanking structures must be drawn accurately and to scale in order for the drawing to serve its purpose in the design review process.
Roof plans must be buildable, accurately drawn and correspond to the elevations.
DEPICTING SITE CONTEXT

Show site plan in its wider context

Show footprints of flanking/nearby properties
INFORM BY CHARACTER

- False dormer
- Raised porch
- Horizontal siding
- Stone cladding
- Window proportions
- Sidelights
- Brick cladding
Garages, sheds and other accessory structures shall be smaller in footprint and overall square footage than the house.

Locate a detached accessory structure on the rear property line.
Use single-loaded driveways not wider than 12 feet in front of the primary façade.
Recommended

Wider parking areas and hammerheads shall be located in the rear yard.
ACCESSORY STRUCTURES SHOWN IN CONTEXT
Historic District A

Respect the original pattern of the neighborhood by locating driveways parallel to the side yard extending from the front property line to the rear yard on the interior side of the lot or for corner lots, are located in the rear yard extending from the street side property line thru the rear yard.
Recommended

Retain and protect original streetscape elements such as the public right of way, streetlamps, sidewalks and curb cuts.

Retain botanical landscaping, i.e. grass, plants, trees and ground covers in the front and street facing side yards.
Recommended

Use appropriate materials and design for fences and walls to convey a compatible appearance to the architecture of the house and its streetscape.
VISUAL EFFECTS OF FRONT YARD PARKING
The primary concern of the historic district is to preserve the overall character, identity and presence of the neighborhood.
ENTRANCES & PORCHES

Contributing properties

At-grade Covered Entry

Raised Covered Porch
EXPRESSING TRADITIONAL FORM & FEATURES

Retention of character-defining form

Original wall plane

Offset wall plane
EXPRESSING TRADITIONAL FORM & FEATURES

- Single wall plane
- Offset wall plane

RECOMMENDED

express gable form by allowing it to project
Recommendation

Follow existing patterns of spacing, mass and orientation for new construction.
SETBACKS

Recommendation

Respect reoccurring design patterns along the block face and streetscape.
AT-GRADE PORCHES
ORIENTATION
DRIVEWAY WIDTH
Recommended

Respect the original pattern of the neighborhood by locating driveways parallel to the side yard extending from the front property line to the rear yard on the interior side of the lot or for corner lots, are located in the rear extending from the street side property line thru the rear yard.
APPROVED PLANS
SUBSEQUENT APPLICATIONS
MIRROR IMAGES

NOT RECOMMENDED
REPETITIVENESS

901

905

909

913

917

NOT RECOMMENDED X
EXPLORATION THROUGH DESIGN

FLOOR PLAN DOES NOT CHANGE FOR THIS OPTION EXCEPT PORCH

ONT ELEVATION - ½ BRICK COLUMN OPTION

SCALE: 1″=1'-0"

FRONT ELEVATION

SCALE: 1″=1'-0"
ONE IMPRESSION
ALTERNATIVES TO REPETITIVENESS
ALTERNATIVES TO REPETITIVENESS
An architect explains why so many cities now look depressingly similar

Published on April 12, 2018

A "creeping sameness" is besetting the planet, prominent New York architect and urban planner Vishaan Chakrabarti argued in a talk at the TED conference Thursday, a trend he says threatens to rob cities of their individuality.

Civic organizations need to laud developers who try to build something different — instead of erecting yet another cookie-cutter structure. Consumers also play a role.

Better design is possible by making greater use of local materials and by insisting on more creative approaches.

A “creeping sameness”

insisting on more creative approaches
Recommended

The presence of driveways and parking areas should be minimal and shall not overwhelm the architecture of the buildings and green spaces of lawns.
Recommended

Materials shall be consistent with the finish, texture, scale and reflectivity to materials historically used within the streetscape and neighborhood.
New construction within a historic district shall not emulate a historic building, but it should reflect the contributing elements and patterns found within the neighborhood, the streetscape and the block where it will be located.
REFLECTING TRADITIONAL ELEMENTS (PORCHES)

Modest raised porch, shaded for outdoor seating

Recommended

Use compatible size, shape and proportion for new porches to preserve the existing historical patterns.
Reflecting Traditional Elements (Porches)

Modest raised porch, shaded for outdoor seating
REFLECTING TRADITIONAL ELEMENTS (PORCHES)

Modest raised porch, shaded for outdoor seating

RECOMMENDED
OUT OF CONTEXT

Covered entrance

Modest raised porch, shaded for outdoor seating

Prominence of garage and parking

NOT RECOMMENDED
Recommended

Additions and alterations must not alter character-defining features, elevations or materials to a degree that would be more than minor.

Alteration to character-defining form, fenestration or materials

NOT RECOMMENDED X
Recommended

Accessory structures must be subordinate to the primary structure and be compatible with the overall massing and design of traditional accessory structures.

Construction of a large two-story accessory structure in a way that crowds the setting, incorporates incompatible features and fenestration, and dominates and detracts from the character of the property with a three-car driveway.

NOT RECOMMENDED
Accessory structures that dominate the original structure or introduce features, materials, or fenestration patterns that detract from the character and setting of a historic structure is **not recommended**.
Additions that require the alteration of a character-defining feature or the original form of a historic structure are **not recommended**.
RELATIONSHIP OF ADDITIONS

RECOMMENDED
RELATIONSHIP OF ADDITIONS

RECOMMENDED
RELATIONSHIP OF ADDITIONS

EXISTING LEFT SIDE ELEVATION
SCALE: 1/8"=1'-0"

NEW LEFT SIDE ELEVATION
SCALE: 1/8"=1'-0"
Additions that require the alteration of a character-defining feature or the original form of a historic structure are not recommended.

Designing in a way that requires the blocking-up of original openings on a character-defining elevation and diminishing the original form of the structure is not recommended.
Design in a way that minimizes the need to adversely affect the form and character of the house is recommended.
Additions that require the alteration of a character-defining feature or the original form of a historic structure are not recommended.

Construction of large shed dormer to utilize attic would obliterate character-defining gable dormers and alter the form and character of the house is not recommended.
Additions whose wall planes and roof ridges are set in/down from the original structure is **recommended** so that the original three-dimensional form, character-defining ridges, corners and planes remain discernable after the addition has been constructed.
Additions whose wall planes and roof ridges are set in/down from the original structure is **recommended** so that the original three-dimensional form, character-defining ridges, corners and planes remain discernable after the addition has been constructed.

**RELATIONSHIP OF ADDITIONS**

*NOT RECOMMENDED*
Constructing an addition so that the original form of the structure is obscured when the new addition extends the same wall or roof plane as the historic structure.

NOT RECOMMENDED
Additions that require blocking-in original character-defining openings or the original form of a historic structure are not recommended.
Construction of a side addition that is joined to the historic structure by a hyphen, thereby respecting the original form and character of the house.

RECOMMENDED
Additions that require blocking-in original character-defining openings or the original form of a historic structure are not recommended.
RELATIONSHIP OF ADDITIONS

RECOMMENDED ✓
STANDARD 9

New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
Additions shall be sufficiently distinguishable from the historic structure but they must also be compatible with the scale, massing and materials that characterize the place.
RELATIONSHIP OF ADDITIONS
RELATIONSHIP OF ADDITIONS

FUTURE ADDITION

NOT RECOMMENDED

RECOMMENDED
RELATIONSHIP OF ADDITIONS
ROOF-TOP ADDITIONS

NOT RECOMMENDED
ROOF-TOP ADDITIONS

SETBACK DIAGRAM FOR ROOF-TOP ADDITIONS

RECOMMENDED
SECOND STORY ADDITIONS

SETBACK DIAGRAM FOR SECOND STORY ADDITIONS

SETBACK DIAGRAM FOR SECOND STORY ADDITIONS

RECOMMENDED

NOT RECOMMENDED
In some instances, a two-dimensional elevation drawing may not be the most effective drawing type to illustrate the likely effect of an addition. In these instances, an “experiential” rendering is appropriate – depicting what the passerby would actually see from across the street.
SECOND STORY ADDITIONS

CASE STUDY A

[Diagram of a house addition with recommended alignment marked]
CASE STUDY B

SECOND STORY ADDITIONS

POSITIONING OF SECOND STORY ADDITION - NOT RECOMMENDED

POSITIONING OF SECOND STORY ADDITION - RECOMMENDED
ARThUR EGELI: Converting a Garage Into a Professional Studio

A garage is often the obvious place to locate a studio, but few conversions from cars to canvases have been as thorough as the one Arthur Egeli just completed.

The garage behind Arthur Egeli’s house in Seattle, Washington, was a perfect structure to convert to a professional studio. It measures 24’ x 24’, the sunlight beside the building connects to the local community. The ceilings are relatively high, and the climate inside remains fairly constant throughout the year. However, the months of work needed to remodel the garage were stressful, especially for an artist who sells as many professional and novice artists. He spends most of his summers in Provincetown, Massachusetts, teaching and operating a gallery.

One of the best pieces of advice I received from my father, Edith Egeli, who has built three studios from the ground up, is that you should learn from the ground up during the course of your career.” Arthur explains. “I grew up in the building, which is a very complex process. I spent years in a studio, and with a lot of effort and hard work, I’ve built a studio that’s very viable. The studio is located in the garden, and at the top of the building, near the roof, there’s a north-facing window, at least five feet above the ground. The studio itself is built on a raised platform, off the ground outside the studio, such as the garden of the house or the grass of the property. And maintaining...
GARAGE ALTERATIONS
GARAGE ALTERATIONS

**RECOMMENDED**

**NOT RECOMMENDED**
GARAGE ALTERATIONS

NOT RECOMMENDED

RECOMMENDED
GARAGE ALTERATIONS
ALTERATIONS TO EXTERIOR MATERIALS

STANDARD 2

The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
ALTERATIONS TO EXTERIOR MATERIALS

NOT RECOMMENDED

NOT RECOMMENDED
Painting of unpainted historic masonry is not recommended.
ALTERATIONS TO CHARACTER-DEFINING FEATURES

NOT RECOMMENDED ✗

RECOMMENDED ✓
ACCESSIBILITY SOLUTIONS

RECOMMENDED

NOT RECOMMENDED
CASE STUDY A – Aluminum Windows

Historic District B

Aluminum doors and windows are prohibited.

Vinyl siding, plastic, and EIFIS are prohibited for use of building envelope materials.

Metal roofs and metal sheeting used as the primary building envelope material on primary residential structures are prohibited.
WINDOWS

Top and side rails typically wider than traditional rails

Meeting rails replaced with a single member that does not produce a comparable visual characteristic and are typically too wide

Bottom rails typically the same width as meeting rail

Projecting sill typically removed

FREQUENT REPLACEMENT WINDOW

NOT RECOMMENDED
Trim applied to siding

Flush-mounted window

Applied sill

Trim thickness

NOT RECOMMENDED

Inset sash with projecting sill

RECOMMENDED
Synthetic columns may be substituted for wood provided that they match size, profile, exposure, detail, relief and dimension and are typical of the period and style of the structure.
CASE STUDY B – Columns

Property 3

Property 4

Subject Property 1
OFF WITH HIS HEAD!!

DEFINITELY NOT RECOMMENDED
THE PROVERBIAL QUESTION

OH MY GOSH

WHO THE #$%& CARES?
“If it be asked us to specify what kind of amount of art, style, or other interest in a building makes it worth protecting, we answer, anything which can be looked on as artistic, picturesque, historical, antique, or substantial: any work, in short, over which educated, artistic people would think it worth while to argue at all.”

William Morris, the SPAB Manifesto (1877)
A SNAPSHOP
OPTIMISM

SO YOU MEAN TO TELL ME ........

THOSE REAL CHALLENGES CAN BE FIXED THIS YEAR?
THANK YOU!!